

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Earth and Planetary Science Letters



www.elsevier.com/locate/epsl

Deciphering old moraine age distributions in SE Tibet showing bimodal climatic signal for glaciations: Marine Isotope Stages 2 and 6



Marie-Luce Chevalier^{a,*}, Anne Replumaz^b

^a Key Laboratory of Deep-Earth Dynamics of Ministry of Natural Resources, Institute of Geology, Chinese Academy of Geological Sciences, 26 Baiwanzhuang Rd, Beijing 100037, People's Republic of China

^b ISTerre, Université Grenoble Alpes, CNRS, Grenoble, France

A R T I C L E I N F O

Article history: Received 27 June 2018 Received in revised form 15 November 2018 Accepted 23 November 2018 Available online 17 December 2018 Editor: A. Yin

Keywords: SE Tibet moraine cosmogenic dating paleoclimate reconstruction Marine Isotope Stages Northern Hemisphere cooling cycles

ABSTRACT

Determining the timing and extent of past glaciations in Tibet is essential to reconstruct regional paleoclimate and understand how atmospheric circulation varies due to the high altitude low latitude Tibetan Plateau. In SE Tibet, geomorphological field observation of glacial deposits shows two main imbricated moraines. We apply statistical analyses to a compilation of eight new ¹⁰Be cosmogenic exposure ages from two moraine crests at GMX site and 128 previously published but recalculated exposure ages from 30 additional crests in the region. The results show that ages from the sharpest inner moraines range from 14-25 ka, corresponding to the full range of Marine oxygen Isotope Stage (MIS)-2 (i.e., Last Glacial Maximum, LGM) with less than 2% of older outliers. The outer moraines have a fundamentally different distribution with scattered ages from 10 to 200 ka, obtained using the same method of sampling, dating, and age modeling proven robust for dating the LGM inner moraines, therefore excluding a methodologic artifact. This large scatter prevents the application of any statistical analysis to the age distribution. At a site with well-developed and preserved imbricated moraines (Cuopu), the outer moraine's oldest ages are MIS-6, with the oldest one being at the MIS-6/MIS-7 limit, identical to what is observed in the regional compilation. Following our observations for the LGM moraines where <2% of older outliers are present, the outer moraines in SE Tibet could not be vounger than MIS-6. This implies that no glacial advance occurred during MIS-3 which is surprising because MIS-3 moraines have been reported to be the most extensive elsewhere in the Himalayan-Tibetan orogen. Indeed, glaciers are sensitive to both precipitation increase and temperature decrease but whether one factor is prevalent remains debated especially on the Tibetan Plateau. Considering negligible erosion of the boulders, as observed in the field at Cuopu, the most conservative interpretation of our observations is that the true emplacement age of the outer moraines external to the LGM moraines is MIS-6. In that case, glacial advances in SE Tibet correlate with the two coldest periods of the Northern Hemisphere cooling cycles, MIS-2 and MIS-6, indicating that these glaciers are mostly sensitive to a decrease in temperature.

© 2018 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

The Himalayan–Tibetan orogen contains the most glaciated mountains outside of the polar regions, from which all large Asian rivers originate and are essential to the life of billions of people. Studying the timing and extent of past glaciations in the Himalayan–Tibetan orogen provides valuable information for regional paleoclimate reconstruction, climatic patterns, and the role of the high-altitude low latitude Tibetan Plateau in regional and

* Corresponding author.

E-mail addresses: mlchevalier@hotmail.com (M.-L. Chevalier), anne.replumaz@univ-grenoble-alpes.fr (A. Replumaz). global atmospheric circulation (e.g., Raymo and Ruddiman, 1992; Owen et al., 2005). Indeed, because snow and ice cover have a profound influence on atmospheric circulation (Prell and Kutzbach, 1992), insight on the Tibetan Plateau glaciations is essential to understand past environmental changes which in turn may help predict future climate changes.

Mountain glaciers are extremely sensitive to temperature and precipitation variations and it is still highly debated whether glacial advances on the Tibetan Plateau occurred when temperature decreased or when precipitation increased. Ages of the numerous imbricated moraines in Tibet provide a chronology of successive (less extensive) glacial advances that can be compared with the Northern Hemisphere cooling cycles recorded as Ma-



Fig. 1. SE Tibet mapped on a Digital Elevation Model with TRMM precipitation data (pixel size $= 4 \times 6 \text{ km}^2$) (Bookhagen and Burbank, 2010). Glacial features from Fu et al. (2012) (within the polygon). Numbers next to colored circles refer to studies in the compilation (Fig. 4), listed in Tables 1 and 2. Study sites from our team in white rectangles. Major towns and peaks are also indicated. Inset shows location of study area within East Asia with dominant climatic systems: mid-latitude Westerlies (MLW) and summer monsoon (SM). (For interpretation of the colors in the figure(s), the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)

rine Isotope Stages (MIS). The two main climatic systems in the Himalayan-Tibetan orogen are the summer monsoon, bringing abundant summer precipitation (as snowfall at high elevation) mostly in the Himalayas as well as the southern and eastern Tibetan Plateau ("monsoon-influenced Tibet"), and the mid-latitude Westerlies, bringing strong winter precipitation to the western regions (Benn and Owen, 1998) (Fig. 1). Throughout the Quaternary, however, the relative importance of these two dominant climatic systems varied significantly, yielding asynchronous glaciations across the orogen (Benn and Owen, 1998; Owen et al., 2005). Many authors found that glacial advances on the Tibetan Plateau during Marine oxygen Isotope Stage (MIS)-3 (~40 ka) were the most common and the most extensive (e.g., Gillespie and Molnar, 1995; Benn and Owen, 1998; Owen et al., 2005, 2008; Finkel et al., 2003; Chevalier et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2013). These authors argued that at that time, precipitation was more abundant and temperature was warmer (due to insolation increase) than during the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM or MIS-2, ~20 ka), thus conditions were favorable to glacial advance (Shi et al., 1999). In contrast, the cold and dry climate over the Tibetan Plateau during the LGM (6-9°C lower and 30-70% less precipitation than present, Shi et al., 1999) was less favorable to glacial advance. In other words, the summer monsoon (with enhanced precipitation) seem to have been the most prevalent factor for glacial advances in most of Tibet. However, in regions such as the western Himalavas and Pamir, where the Westerlies dominate, glaciers were more extensive during the LGM than during MIS-3, in correspondence with the Northern Hemisphere glaciations which reflect global trends in temperature (e.g., Owen and Dortch, 2014; Eugster et al., 2016).

Here, we focus on SE Tibet (Fig. 1), where a series of imbricated moraine systems are characterized by two prominent crests, best illustrated at Cuopu (Fig. 2), our case study published by our team for tectonic purposes (Chevalier et al., 2016). Several studies have used cosmogenic exposure dating of boulders (¹⁰Be, ²⁶Al, ²¹Ne) to date moraines from SE Tibet (e.g., Schäfer et al., 2002; Tschudi et al., 2003; Owen et al., 2005; Wang et al., 2006; Graf et al., 2008; Strasky et al., 2009; Fu et al., 2013a; Chevalier et al., 2016, 2017; Bai et al., 2018) which collectively provide a large dataset to interpret the chronology of regional past glacial advances. The younger, sharper moraine crests located in the inner part of the moraine system have been intensively sampled and dated as LGM. In contrast, few papers present reliable data for the prominent moraines external to the LGM ones (Fu et al., 2013a; Chevalier et al., 2016, 2017). This is mainly due to two problems. The first one is that it can be challenging to find enough suitable samples to date these older deposits due to their poor preservation compared to younger deposits. The second problem is that once dated, the ages of these old moraines are widely scattered, yielding strong uncertainties about their emplacement age, i.e., the deglaciation age, as deglaciation is coeval with moraine abandonment, initiating a period of shape stability and preservation (Fig. 2D).

In this paper, we provide new ¹⁰Be exposure ages for eight boulders collected from two moraine crests at Gemuxiang (GMX) site in the Shaluli Mountains, and compile data from 30 addi-



Fig. 2. Cuopu site. (A) Google Earth image of the Cuopu moraine crests 'a-f'. Individual crests highlighted by white dashed lines or open yellow circles showing sample locations and names. Red arrowheads indicate the Cuopu fault. Black and white '+' show the boundaries of the crest profiles (Fig. S9). (B, C) Field views of Cuopu moraine crests 'c' and 'd' (location in A), showing a much sharper and higher crest 'd' than crest 'c', on which boulders are nevertheless present. Person circled for scale. (D) ¹⁰Be cosmogenic surface-exposure ages of Cuopu moraines (using the Lal (1991)/Stone (2000) time-dependent model, Tables 1 and 2) with 1 σ uncertainty. Red symbol represents the outlier discarded using Peirce's criterion and discussed in the text. To the right, global climatic proxy curve of Lisiecki and Raymo (2005) with gray-shaded sectors showing the Marine oxygen lsotope Stages (MIS).

tional crests located in each of the main mountain ranges of the eastern Hengduan Mountains of SE Tibet. For the younger, inner moraines, a very strong MIS-2 signal with clustered boulder exposure ages spanning the entire stage and with <2% of outliers has been shown in previous studies and compiled here. Exposure ages on boulders from the outer, older moraines are instead highly scattered from ~ 10 to 200 ka, with the oldest ages ranging from MIS-5 to MIS-7 depending on the moraine (Fu et al., 2013a; Chevalier et al., 2016, 2017). We study here the age distribution of these old moraines, which appears fundamentally different from that of the younger moraines, to try to determine their emplacement age and answer the following questions. Is a large age scatter from 10 to 200 ka representative of the age distribution of the old moraines? Is the scattering of the old moraine ages an artifact due to a problem of methodology or sampling strategy, or is it only due to moraine degradation? Would collecting numerous samples on a few moraine crests or a few samples on numerous crests better reveal the true age of a moraine? Is the oldest age representing a minimum emplacement age or the true emplacement age?

2. Study area and background

The eastern Hengduan Mountains, located in eastern Tibet, comprise several large mountain ranges such as the \sim NS-trending Shaluli Mountains, the Queer Range to the north, and the Daxue Range to the east (Fig. 1). This region was extensively glaciated during the Quaternary (Li et al., 1991), evidenced at present by numerous extensive glacial landforms such as erratics, U-shaped valleys, moraines and glacial lakes (mapped in great details by Fu et al., 2012, Fig. 1). Glaciated areas in the Hengduan Mountains were 41 times larger during the LGM than at present (Shi, 2002) but few present-day glaciers remain.

The topography of the massive Shaluli Mountains (which stretch \sim 450 km, down to Myanmar) is mostly characterized by high-relief mountains with deeply incised valleys, but also by two low-relief granite plateaus, the Haizishan and Xinlong Plateaus (yellow in Fig. 1, Fu et al., 2012). A \sim 3600 km² ice cap (up to 800 m thick) covered the Haizishan Plateau during the Quaternary. Glaciers are absent today because the present-day Equilibrium Line Altitude (ELA) at 5200 m is higher than the peak elevation of the plateau (~4900 m) (Li et al., 1996). Numerous large moraines and U-shaped valleys flank the plateau, long and deep ones in the east versus short, steep and narrow ones in the west (Fu et al., 2013a). The most distinct and extensive moraines correspond to the terminus of former outlet glaciers or the limit of the former Haizishan ice cap margin (Fu et al., 2013a). The Queer Range stretches for \sim 150 km NW of the city of Ganzi and culminates at 6168 m (Mt. Queer, Fig. 1). It is covered by numerous glaciers and small ice caps at present. The \sim 150 km-long, currently heavily glaciated Daxue Range is located at the eastern edge of the Tibetan Plateau, where its mean elevation dramatically drops to the Sichuan Basin (from >4000 to \sim 500 m a.s.l.). The highest peak in the NW Daxue Range (also called Zheduo Range at that location) is Yala Mt. (5820 m), and in the SE Daxue Range, Gongga Shan at 7556 m is the highest peak in eastern Tibet (Fig. 1).

Few ages older than MIS-6 have been reported in SE Tibet for the outermost moraines of the moraine system. Only one cosmogenic exposure age of a boulder at 298.3 ka (MIS-8) assuming zero erosion or ~421 ka (MIS-12) applying an erosion rate of ~1 mm/ka (Wang et al., 2006) and one ESR age of 556.7 \pm 62.6 ka (Xu and Zhou, 2009), have been reported at the Kuzhaori moraine complex, formed by an outlet glacier in the SW Haizishan Plateau (#7 in Fig. 1). Its geometry is very similar to that of Cuopu, with two highly degraded outermost moraine crests (Fig. 2A). Finding suitable samples for ¹⁰Be cosmogenic exposure dating on these highly degraded moraines has been challenging; only one boulder was found on the two outermost moraines at Cuopu dated at 78 ka (crest 'b'), much younger than the adjacent, younger moraine 'c' at 191 ka, in disagreement with moraine stratigraphy (Chevalier et al., 2016, Fig. 2D). The ages of the oldest moraines in SE Tibet are still unresolved; determining their ages is highly challenging and beyond the scope of this paper. Therefore, we focus our discussion on the two most recent glaciations in SE Tibet which left the two most prominent and preserved imbricated moraines (Fig. 2).

SE Tibet belongs to the monsoon-influenced Tibet region which at places, receives >900 mm/yr of precipitation along the deeply incised, ~NS-trending river valleys (Fig. 1, Bookhagen and Burbank, 2010; Yu et al., 2018). In contrast, central and western Tibet only receive ~200 mm/yr of precipitation, yielding the formation of continental cold glaciers (Shi, 2002). This led Owen et al. (2008) to suggest that glacial advances in SE Tibet respond to both oscillations in the summer monsoon and the Northern Hemisphere cooling cycles (Owen et al., 2008). However, Fu et al. (2013a) suggested that glacial advances in SE Tibet respond only to the Northern Hemisphere cooling cycles, by dating 14 moraine crests and interpreting the deglaciation ages to be Late glacial, MIS-2, MIS-6 or older, plus at least one older glaciation.

3. Methods

To determine the timing of glaciation in SE Tibet, we compile ¹⁰Be cosmogenic data reported for 128 moraine boulders and recalculate their exposure ages to obtain a homogeneous dataset. We also add eight new large granite boulder exposure ages from the GMX moraine crests (Fig. S1). The ¹⁰Be concentration in the top few centimeters of the largest boulders found on moraine crests (collected using chisel and hammer) can be interpreted as the exposure time of the boulder to incoming cosmic rays (see review papers such as Lal, 1991; Gosse and Phillips, 2001). In the ideal case of the boulder being exposed on the moraine surface since deposition, with no exposure prior to deposition and no rolling or surface erosion since deposition, the exposure time of the boulder will correspond to the age of the moraine. Mineral separation (target mineral is quartz) and quartz cleaning procedure is modified from Kohl and Nishiizumi (1992). We additionally present 59 samples collected on seven moraine crests in the region by our team for tectonic purposes using the same technique, with >8samples per crest (Chevalier et al., 2016, 2017; Bai et al., 2018). We then compile published regional studies using ¹⁰Be exposure dating (Tables 1 and 2), for which more than one boulder per moraine crest older than 13 ka has been collected, and for which all sample and Accelerator Mass Spectrometer (AMS) measurement details needed for exposure age (re)calculations are provided. These criteria exclude several regional studies such as Owen et al. (2005) (too young), Wang et al. (2006) (missing ¹⁰Be concentration and AMS standard used, preventing recalculation) and Zhang et al. (2015) (only one sample per crest) as well as some individual moraine crests from studies included in the compilation (Lit 7 in Schäfer et al., 2002; TSO-1 in Graf et al., 2008; K101 in Strasky et al., 2009; crest 'R' in Fu et al., 2013a; Cuopu crests 'b' and 'f' in Chevalier et al., 2016). To discuss which particular MIS glacial stage corresponds to each moraine emplacement, we interpret the boulder age distribution through statistical analysis and compare it with proxy data such as the global stack of benthic δ^{18} O curve of Lisiecki and Raymo (2005).

3.1. ¹⁰Be surface-exposure dating and model-age calculation

Several factors may influence the ¹⁰Be concentration in the collected samples. Processes like rolling and erosion, as well as shielding, yield ages younger than the moraine emplacement age,

	moraine
	inner
	¹⁰ Be
	Tibet
Table 1	Eastern

Eastern Tibet ¹⁰ Be	e inner moraine .	ages.																
Reference	Area	Site name	# in Fig. 1	Sample name	Lat (°N)	Long (°E)	Elev. (m a.s.l.)	Thick- ness (cm)	Density (g/cm ³)	Shielding	¹⁰ Be (at/g)	err	Standard 1	Pub- lished age	± I R	tecalcu- ated age 1. 2.3 ^a	+	Class ^b
<i>Inner moraines</i> This study	Shaluli Mountains	GMX inner		GMX-7 GMX-8	29.39991 29.40141	100.27442 100.27604	4451 4434	5	2.7 2.7	0.98 0.98	1165380 1231295	36174 40234	07KNSTD 07KNSTD	1	2	:1406 :2654	2104 2240	0
Bai et al. (2018)	Daxue Range	YJG		것 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20	30.051155 30.050633 30.050633 30.05033 30.05471 30.054779 30.056779 30.056793 30.056313	101.928773 101.928755 101.9286476 101.926476 101.92668 101.929665 101.929655 101.929657	3502 3514 3521 3562 3475 3475 3475 3475 3475	ى م م م م م م م م	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0	600619 330019 349995 368524 619187 289736 357576 261488 261488 540259	24885 14343 16116 16116 23023 23023 12886 9963 7778 13541	07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD	17652 1 9834 9 9834 9 10386 1 10708 1 18391 8 88779 8 10887 1 10887 1 10587 1 16217 1	1749 1 963 9 963 9 963 9 963 9 963 9 963 9 963 9 963 9 963 9 963 9 964 1 1154 1 1817 1 1817 1 8371 8 8371 8 1058 1 1542 1	7652 1834 0386 0708 8391 1779 0887 0887 6217	1749 963 1011 1154 1154 1817 871 1058 779 1542	Q
		SLH		SIH-1 SIH-2 SIH-3 SIH-4 SIH-5 SIH-5 SIH-6 SIH-8 SIH-8 SIH-10 ^c	30.245064 30.244172 30.244172 30.242491 30.242491 30.24065 30.239196 30.239021 30.238659 30.238536	101.717376 101.717552 101.716548 101.716246 101.716246 101.716334 101.716334 101.712253 101.712553 101.712457	4271 4265 4242 4241 4234 4233 4223 4223 4223 4224	ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0	1042537 912145 927520 847888 847888 892433 938688 1068412 1127175 1022500 1377017	20881 18738 18738 18738 18738 18845 18845 18845 18845 20632 20632 21135 21135 2222 2222	07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD	20262 17977 18465 18465 18864 17864 17864 17864 17866 222346 222346 22337 26766 226766 226766 20337	1932 2 1723 1 1723 1 1715 1 1715 1 1715 1 2021 2 2021 2 2021 2 2021 2 2021 2 2021 2 2022 2 2572 2	(1262) 7977 8465 6997 7864 7866 7766 11209 12346 (0337 (0337 (0766	1932 1723 1825 1636 1715 1797 2021 2125 1941 2572 2572	m
Chevalier et al. (2016)	Shaluli Mountains	Cuopu d		LIC-10 ^c LIC-11 LIC-12 LIC-13 LIC-14 LIC-15	30.49535 30.49407 30.49258 30.49138 30.49138 30.48356 30.48244	99.55858 99.55808 99.55746 99.55695 99.55147 99.55099	4296 4292 4289 4279 4106	იი იი იი იი იი	2.2.2 7.7.2.5 7.7.5 7.5	80.08 80.09 80.00 80.09 80.00 80.09 80.000 80.000 80.000 80.000 80.000 80.000 80.000 80.0000 80.000000 80.00000000	1721735 978714 851187 865410 850501 850501	55639 33442 24420 24869 24366 24233	07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD	28885 2 17205 1 15144 1 15460 1 15544 1 15544 1 15544 1 16412 1	2633 3 1574 1 1355 1 1384 1 1391 1 1461 1	1786 9121 6827 7162 7463 8380	3146 1899 1640 1673 1702 1784	æ
		Cuopu e		LIC-17 LIC-28 LIC-29	30.48278 30.48145 30.48107	99.54843 99.54565 99.54456	4173 4156 4152	ഗഗഗ	2.7 2.7 2.7	0.98 0.98 0.98	840820 832941 857326	24251 23078 26329	07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD	15786 1 15866 1 16284 1	414 1 415 1 469 1	7544 7529 8036	1711 1704 1770	Ŧ
Chevalier et al. (2017)	Queer Range	ZDG		206-1 206-2 206-3 206-4 206-5 206-5 206-6 206-6 206-0 206-1 206-10	32.109997 32.110398 32.112113 32.112113 32.112113 32.115066 32.115665 32.115665 32.118565 32.118361	98.85129 98.851279 98.851143 98.851144 98.851186 98.851970 98.852399 98.852399 98.852347 98.85278	4144 4138 4111 4060 4050 4050 4033 4037 4037	ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ ດ	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0 80.0	741133 789157 928323 1046391 1087648 1186922 924781 924781 1122651 758114	23215 27231 13583 13583 13583 13583 15848 16498 18048 15491 15491 15491 24012 24012	07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD	13982 14878 14878 17431 17431 19480 19480 19480 19480 19480 17863 117865 1178655 1178655 117865555 11786555555555555555555555555	263 1 1362 1 1501 1 1501 1 1501 1 1551 1 1795 2 1952 2 1952 2 1564 1 1761 2 1360 1	5221 6173 9043 11304 12582 9556 9529 11018 13480 6340	1495 1607 1796 20136 20134 2134 2323 2323 2323 2080 2080 2280 2080 1608	0
Tschudi et al. (2003)	Daxue Range		1	kan1 kan2	30.075 30.075	101.813 101.813	4240 4260	1.5 1.3	2.7 2.7	1	916500 786500	58700 51900	S555 S555	12910 1 10970 9	1070 1 320 1	6076 3794	1819 1575	0
Strasky et al. (2009)	Daxue Range		1	kan102 kan103 kan104	30.0583 30.0592 30.0578	101.8278 101.8263 101.8258	4061 4071 4058	ოოო	2.7 2.7 2.7	0.946 0.976 0.968	759000 851000 826000	31000 38000 43000	S555 S555 S555	13700 5 14900 6 14600 7	500 500 700 1	5623 6782 6553	1589 1734 1768	£
Schäfer et al. (2002)	Shaluli Mountains		7	Lit3 Lit4a ^c Lit4bc Lit5a Lit5b Lit6	303 205 205 205 205 205 205 205 205 205 205	99.54 99.54 99.54 99.54	4560 4560 4560 4610 4610 4570	N m N m m m	5. 5. 5. 5. 5. 5. 5. 5. 5. 5. 5. 5. 5. 5		1108000 1432000 1198000 1253000 1247000 1248000	92000 123000 103000 101000 101000		13700 1 17700 2 17800 1 15100 1 15300 1 15300 1	1400 1 2000 2 1700 1 1600 1 1400 1	6847 11525 8102 8608 8525 8868	2106 2736 2299 2327 2321 2333	Ŧ
Fu et al. (2013a)	Shaluli Mountains	Ж	e	TB-09-112 TB-09-114	29.42658 29.42657	100.08858 100.0889	4461 4459	6 4	2.7 2.7		785493 772488	33737 27307	07KNSTD 07KNSTD	13000 1 12900 1	1200 1	4339 4241	1471 1418	0
		_	εn	TB-09-13 ^c TB-09-12 TB-09-14 TB-09-15	29.41885 29.41848 29.41877 29.41178	100.01755 100.01782 100.0223 100.02077	4431 4424 4446 4424	2 2 5 4.5	2.7 2.7 2.7		1047811 968473 900914 901018	34925 33026 34603 35488	07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD	17100 1 16000 1 15200 1 15300 1	1600 1 1500 1 1400 1 1400 1	8810 7543 6638 6741	1862 1741 1677 1694	4
		z	4	TB-09-76 TB-09-75 TB-09-74	29.85655 29.85673 29.85743	99.95317 99.95308 99.9531	4311 4313 4339	4 m 4	2.7 2.7 2.7		1260059 1184282 992215	46121 33861 39244	07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD	21600 2 20200 1 17100 1	2000 2 1800 2 1600 1	:3614 :2162 8750 (conti	2368 2163 1899 inued on ne	3 xt page)

Table 1 (continued)	(
Reference	Area	Site name	# in Fig. 1	Sample name	Lat (°N)	(°E) Long	Elev. (m a.s.l.)	Thick- ness (cm)	Density (g/cm ³)	Shielding	¹⁰ Be (at/g)	err	Standard	Pub- lished age	+I	Recalcu- lated age v. 2.3 ^a	+H	Class ^b
Graf et al. (2008)	Shaluli Mountains	Xinlong Plateau	5	TSO-2 TSO-3	31.08667 31.08667	99.755 99.755	4138 4138	2 2	2.7 2.7	0.981 0.981	1280000 1250000	50000 40000	S555 S555	20100 19700	1000 800	22855 22374	2313 2207	C
			ŝ	TSO-4 TSO-5 TSO-6	31.08667 31.08833 31.08833	99.75667 99.755 99.755	4150 4150 4150	5 2 2	2.7 2.7 2.7	0.969 0.981 0.981	1190000 1080000 1150000	50000 30000 30000	S555 S555 S555	19100 16800 18000	1000 700 700	21518 19443 20615	2203 1891 1996	в
			5	TSO-7 TSO-8 TSO-9	31.09 31.09 31.09333	99.76 99.75833 99.75833	4156 4161 4172	4 3	2.7 2.7 2.7	0.964 0.973 0.954	1170000 1070000 1310000	50000 30000 40000	S555 S555 S555	18500 16800 20800	900 700 800	21227 19322 23555	2179 1881 2313	В
Samples GMX were pr ^a Ages calculated w	rocessed at IPG Strat vith the CRONUS 2.3	sbourg and the ¹ scalculator using	¹⁰ Be/ ⁹ Be r. g the Lal (atios were measure 1991)/Stone (2000)	d at CEREGE (NIS time-dependent	T SRM4325 (= production rat	NIST_27900) w e model. ¹⁰ Be	vith ¹⁰ Be isot ⁱ production ra	ope ratios = 2. ¹ the is 4.1 $at/g/a$.	79 × 1e–11, eq	uivalent to 07I	(NSTD). No	erosion rate v	vas applied.				

Class is defined following Heyman (2014), using the reduced Chi-square (χ_R^2) analysis. See text for details

Outliers from MIS-2 samples rejected using Peirce's criterion (following Blomdin et al., 2016).

while nuclide inheritance, associated with prior exposure, yields ages older than the moraine emplacement age (e.g., Heyman et al., 2011). We corrected for topographic shielding (measured in the field) but not for snow cover due the lack of site-specific or even regional data. The vegetation cover is in general minimal at the study sites so that its shielding is negligible. We recalculated the exposure ages from the compilation using the CRONUS calculator version 2.3 (Balco et al., 2008) (Tables 1 and 2) with the widely used Lal (1991)/Stone (2000) time-dependent scaling model. First, we assume zero erosion and take the calculated apparent ages as minimum ages. Second, we discuss the influence of both the erosion of the boulder surface and of the moraine matrix, which results in rounding and smoothing of the moraine crest with time and gradual or episodic exhumation of initially buried boulders, both of which result in boulder exposure ages that are younger than the moraine emplacement age. We also attempt to sort the boulders according to their ages or their position along the moraine crests discussed here (Figs. S1-S7) to determine whether a correlation exists between boulder sizes, their position on the crest and their ages.

One may examine the influence of erosion on boulder exposure ages by applying a rate of 1 to 3 mm/ka, as deduced from nearby studies, using the height difference between a quartzite knob and its granite boulder surface (Graf et al., 2008) or between glaciallypolished bedrock underneath and next to an erratic boulder (Wang et al., 2006). Applying a 1 mm/ka erosion rate yields a negligible apparent exposure age increase of <2% for 20 ka samples (inner moraines) and a more substantial age increase of 22% for our oldest age on the outer moraine at Cuopu at 191 ka (MIS-6/MIS-7 boundary) (becoming 234 ka, MIS-7). A 3 mm/ka erosion rate increases 20 ka sample ages by <5%, which is still negligible, and 191 ka ages become saturated in CRONUS, therefore deeply affecting old ages and shifting the MIS to a much older period, possibly older than the oldest ages ever measured in SE Tibet.

The erosion rate of 1 mm/ka applied to the outermost moraines, which then belong to MIS-12 (Wang et al., 2006), seems a reasonable maximum rate. In any case, since no direct measurement of present-day or past erosion rate exists for our region of interest, we consider that adding such unconstrained erosion rate leads to high uncertainties. Therefore, we choose to assume zero erosion when calculating the ages in CRONUS and we interpret the continuous distribution of older moraine ages as reflecting erosion of the moraine matrix and of the boulder surface, which we will discuss in detail using field observations.

3.2. Statistical analysis of the age distribution

In order to statistically test whether outliers are present in a single moraine age distribution of more than two samples, we apply Peirce's criterion (Peirce, 1852) following Blomdin et al. (2016). We then apply the reduced Chi-square (χ_R^2) analysis to test whether a single moraine age distribution is well-clustered following Heyman (2014), who suggested the following classification: Class A defines moraines having well-clustered ages and a $\chi_R^2 \leq 2$, class B defines moraines having moderately-clustered ages and a $\chi^2_R > 2$ as well as a mean exposure age >85% of the oldest exposure age, and class C defines moraines having poorlyclustered ages, i.e., which do not fit into classes A nor B. For class A moraines, one may take the mean age to represent the deglaciation age while for classes B and C moraines, the oldest age best represents the minimum deglaciation age (Heyman, 2014), with a true emplacement age that could be much older (e.g., Heyman et al., 2011; Fu et al., 2013a). Moraine crests with only two samples (four such crests falling in the inner moraine group and one crest falling in the outer moraine group, Tables 1 and 2) are automatically labeled as class C. Since class C moraines all have $\chi_R^2 > 2$

111

1 1	17	
1.	LZ	

	b	name	(°N)		ciev. (m a.s.l.)	ness (cm)	(g/cm ³)	Shielding	u Be (at/g)	err	Standard	Pub- lished age	H	kecalcu- lated age v. 2.3ª	H	Class ^b
	7	TB-08-19 TB-08-20 TB-08-21	29.12353 29.12295 29.12258	100.20957 100.20913 100.20882	3904 3904 3904	4 5 2	2.7 2.7 2.7		5571308 5812484 6513632	97268 147660 238263	07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD	105700 112400 123800	9300 10200 11700	115681 123090 136959	11238 12207 14131	в
o	ø	TB-09-04 TB-09-02 TB-09-03	30.86763 30.86815 30.86843	99.6377 99.64302 99.64295	4063 4043 4036	ოოო	2.7 2.7 2.7		7124691 8984509 10472668	114697 256643 272273	07KNSTD 07KNSTD 07KNSTD	120100 155100 183600	10600 14400 17000	132554 173051 200740	12898 17539 20336	U
Chevalier et al. Shaluli Cuopu c (2016) Mountains		LIC-20 LIC-21 LIC-22 LIC-23 LIC-24 LIC-24 LIC-25 LIC-25	30,48948 30,48852 30,48642 30,48384 30,48384 30,48206 30,47865 30,47812 30,47812	99.55889 99.55858 99.55575 99.55473 99.55309 99.55197 99.54978 99.54898	4246 4243 4199 4199 4193 4186 4181	ດດາດອີດອີດອີດອີດອີດອີດອີດອີດອີດອີດອີດອີດອີດ	2.2 7.2 7.7 7.2 7.7 7.2 7.2 7.2	86.0 89.0 89.0 89.0 89.0 80.0 80.0 80.0	9062644 3030450 5006816 8242716 5901635 10284488 6299673 7603770	125465 53503 91206 120469 89037 141577 97123 112322	07 KNSTD 07 KNSTD 07 KNSTD 07 KNSTD 07 KNSTD 07 KNSTD 07 KNSTD 07 KNSTD	145435 47938 83079 134627 98276 173075 104612 124729	13046 4195 7366 12050 8697 15669 9284 11130	164018 54878 92715 151657 108716 191525 115526 139833	16026 5252 8968 14790 10497 118842 11180 13600	U

Ages calculated with the CRONUS 2.3 calculator using the Lal (1991)/Stone (2000) time-dependent production rate model. 10 Be production rate is 4.1 at/g/a

Class is defined following Heyman (2014), using the reduced Chi-square (χ^2_R) analysis. See text for details.

р

here, the oldest age represents the minimum moraine deglaciation age (Heyman, 2014).

4. Results: the Gemuxiang (GMX) site

The Gemuxiang (GMX) moraines are located in the southern Shaluli Mountains (Fig. 1), \sim 65 km south of the city of Litang and \sim 40 km north of the city of Daocheng, where its former outlet glacier was flowing northeastward from the Haizishan Plateau (Fu et al., 2012, 2013b and Fig. 1). The GMX moraines are \sim 3 kmlong and consist of more than four distinct crests, with several preserved frontal crests inside which a large glacial lake remains (Fig. 3). The crests are steep (5°) and high (~ 200 m), with the outer crest covered by small bushes and the inner crests covered by trees on the inward-facing slopes (Fig. 3). Eight samples from the largest granite boulders (with coarse, friable grains) were collected on the eastern crests (Figs. 3B and S1). The two samples from the inner crest are similar at 21.4 ± 2.1 and 22.7 ± 2.2 ka (Figs. 4, S8 and Table 1) and correspond to the LGM. The six ages from the outer crest range from 28.3 ± 2.7 to 141.8 ± 13.8 ka. Applying Peirce's criterion to this dataset shows that the outer moraine is class C, i.e., poorly-clustered so that the oldest age represents the minimum deglaciation age, which is MIS-6. We will further discuss and compare this exposure age distribution with that of the regional compilation, to better evaluate the significance of the scattered age distribution, considering that statistical analyses on such large age scatter are irrelevant.

5. Review of existing data

5.1. The case study site with imbricated moraines: the Cuopu site

The Cuopu moraines are located in the northern Shaluli Mountains (Fig. 1). They are one of the most extensive and preserved imbricated moraines in SE Tibet due to their emplacement in a wide sedimentary basin opened by the Cuopu normal fault exhuming the adjacent range (Chevalier et al., 2016). There was only one main glacier flowing over ~ 10 km from the highest local peak, avoiding interaction between adjacent moraines. A series of imbricated moraines are observed around the glacial lake (Fig. 2), with the two oldest crests ('a' and 'b') being preserved outwards to the east thanks to the former right-lateral strike-slip component of the Cuopu fault (Fig. 2A) (Chevalier et al., 2016). These crests are highly degraded with no boulder remaining on crest 'a' and only one boulder remaining on crest 'b' (Chevalier et al., 2016). The sharpest and highest moraine (crest 'd') is covered by numerous large granite boulders and trees on the inward-facing slopes (Fig. 2B, C). Closer to the lake, younger moraines are also covered by large granite boulders and are sharp-crested but lower, with multiple sub-crests hard to distinguish from one another due to their close proximity (among which crest 'e' in Fig. 2A). Farther from the lake, the prominent moraine 'c' surrounds moraine 'd' but is sub-rounded and much lower (Fig. 2B, C). It is also covered by numerous large granite boulders and short grass (Fig. 2C).

Seventeen samples have been collected from crests 'c, d, e' (Chevalier et al., 2016) (Fig. 2D and Tables 1 and 2). Applying Peirce's criterion and using the reduced Chi-square analysis, the youngest moraine 'e' shows no outlier and can be classified as class A (Fig. 4), thus the average age of 17.7 ± 0.3 ka (n = 3) represents the deglaciation age. The sharpest and highest crest 'd', with ages ranging between 17.2 ± 1.7 and 19.2 ± 1.9 ka, can also be classified as class field as class A excluding one outlier (sample LIC-10 at 31.8 ± 3.1 ka), so that the mean age of 17.8 ± 0.9 ka (n = 5) is taken to represent the deglaciation age. Therefore, moraines 'e' and 'd' are LGM with only one older outlier. In contrast the outer prominent moraine 'c'

Table 2 (continued)



Fig. 3. Gemuxiang (GMX) site. (A, B) Site GMX on Google Earth images (29.39991°N-100.27442°E) showing samples location as well as location of photos C–F. Black '+' show the boundaries of the crest profiles (Fig. S9). (C) View looking upstream at the GMX moraine complex and the Haizishan Plateau. (D) View from the eastern outer crest, looking at the inner, frontal and western crests. (E, F) Close-up photos of the crests where one can see boulder sizes and vegetation cover.



Fig. 4. Compilation of ¹⁰Be moraine ages (with 1σ uncertainties) from SE Tibet (purple and blue symbols refer to samples from our team), recalculated using CRONUS v2.3 (Tables 1 and 2). Vertical dashed lines separate the different crests within each study. The inner moraines clearly show a LGM (MIS-2) signal. Outer moraine ages are scattered, reflecting moraines' degradation, with the oldest ages being MIS-6, interpreted as the deglaciation age. Red symbols represent outliers rejected by Peirce's criterion and discussed in the text. Colors at the bottom of the graph refer to well-clustered (green, class A), moderately-clustered (yellow, class B) and poorly-clustered (red, class C) moraine ages, obtained using the reduced Chi-square (χ_R^2) analysis (Heyman, 2014). See text for details. Site abbreviation names refer to Yangiagou (YJG), Gemuxiang (GMX), Ganzi (GZ), Zhuqing (ZDG) and Selaha (SLH) moraines. The latter two sites are described in detail in the Supplemental material and Fig. S10.

has a completely different age distribution, with ages widely scattered between 54.9 ± 5.3 and 191.5 ± 18.8 ka (n = 8), i.e., mostly falling within MIS-5 and MIS-6, with only the youngest sample being MIS-3 and the oldest one being MIS-6/MIS-7 considering uncertainties (Fig. 2D).

5.2. The Ganzi (GZ) moraine

The Ganzi (GZ) moraines are located in the SE Queer Range, ~40 km NW of the city of Ganzi (Fig. 1). This part of the range still has several small glaciers and numerous large U-shaped valleys and moraines that extend ~4 km north of the range. This sampling was originally done for tectonic purposes because the GZ moraine is offset by the Ganzi fault by ~800 m (Chevalier et al., 2017). The most extensive GZ moraines have a smoother topography than the more recent moraines upstream (Fig. 5D) and are covered by grass and small bushes (Fig. 5E), as well as small granite boulders (Fig. S4). Chevalier et al. (2017) collected 12 samples from the western crest whose ages are widespread and 'continuous' from 9.6 \pm 0.9 to 102.1 \pm 10 ka, with the oldest age corresponding to MIS-5 (Fig. 4 and Table 2).

5.3. The Yangjiagou (YJG) moraine: a degraded LGM moraine

In order to further discuss the influence of erosion on moraine age distributions, we present here in detail a peculiar inner moraine, the Yangjiagou (YJG) moraine. It is located in the NW Daxue Range, in a steep environment along the deeply entrenched Kangding valley, ~ 6 km NW of the city of Kangding (Fig. 1). This part of the range does not have contemporary glaciers but numerous glacial lakes and young moraines abound towards the highest peaks, resembling a scoured terrain. However, few moraines are well-defined and are present as low as the YJG moraine. It has previously been studied by several authors who suggested a qualitative age only. Allen et al. (1991) were the first ones to draw attention to the YJG moraine by conducting field work and remote sensing on the active Xianshuihe fault (Fig. 1), whose Selaha

fault branch cuts and left-laterally offsets the YJG moraine crest by ${\sim}80$ m (Bai et al., 2018).

The YJG moraine is <2 km-long, and is covered by large granite boulders and small bushes (Fig. 5C). Allen et al. (1991) inferred an age of 13 ka, arguing that the moraine must have formed at the peak of glaciation in order to become stable enough to start being offset by the Selaha fault, and Chen et al. (2016) inferred an age of 18 ka. Bai et al. (2018) collected nine samples along the crest and quantitatively determined exposure ages that range from 8.0 ± 0.8 to 18.4 ± 1.8 ka (Figs. 4, S8 and Table 1). No outlier is statistically rejected and YJG is class C with the oldest age being LGM.

5.4. Other study sites in SE Tibet

Numerous studies have sampled the inner moraines in SE Tibet (Schäfer et al., 2002; Tschudi et al., 2003; Graf et al., 2008; Strasky et al., 2009; Fu et al., 2013a; Chevalier et al., 2016, 2017; Bai et al., 2018) (Figs. 4, S8 and Table 1). In contrast, few cosmogenic datasets are available for the outer moraines: one presented in this paper (GMX outer, n = 6), two published by our team (Cuopu crest 'c' in Chevalier et al., 2016 with n = 10; GZ in Chevalier et al., 2017 with n = 12), and one dataset published by Fu et al. (2013a) with 42 samples on 14 moraine crests, but with only 2–4 samples per crest. The three sites studied by our team are presented in detail in this paper (Figs. 2, 3 and 5), while details about each site from Fu et al. (2013a) can be found in the publication.

Surprisingly, the large dataset of Fu and collaborators (the only other study of older moraines using ¹⁰Be in SE Tibet), show that their age compilation with only 2–4 samples per moraine on numerous moraine crests (n = 14) is similar to our dense sampling (n = 6-10) on three crests (Cuopu, GZ and GMX). When taken together, the compilation of all outer moraine ages shows continuous ages between mostly MIS-5 and MIS-6 with two ages at the MIS-6/MIS-7 limit, i.e., 68% of the outer moraine ages fall within MIS-5 and MIS-6 (n = 46) with only 1/3 being MIS-4 or younger (n = 22, i.e. 32%).



Fig. 5. YJG and GZ sites. (A, B) Site Yangjiagou (YJG) on Google Earth images showing the samples location as well as location of photo C, modified from Bai et al. (2018). (C) Photo looking upstream at the YJG crest. Note the large boulder (YJG-5) and people for scale. (D) Ganzi (GZ) site on Google Earth image with Chevalier et al.'s (2017) samples location on the most extensive moraine crest. Location of photo E is indicated. (E) View of GZ moraine from the location of samples GZ-8-13 with the crests in white dashed lines. White '+' show the boundaries of the crest profiles (Fig. S9).

6. Discussion and interpretation

6.1. Clustered age distribution of inner moraines: LGM emplacement

All data from the compilation of SE Tibet inner moraines, except YJG, show a homogeneous pattern with ages spanning the full range of MIS-2 (LGM), i.e., 14 to 25 ka, with <2% of older outliers (Figs. 4 and S8). If each moraine age distribution is taken individually, four outliers out of 59 samples are statistically rejected (red in Figs. 4 and S8) while if taken as a single distribution, only one outlier (LIC-10) out of 59 samples is statistically rejected. This low percentage of outliers (<2%) older than MIS-2 indicates that there is no significant nuclide inheritance affecting the boulders emplaced with the LGM moraines. Taking the average age of all samples except the four outliers discarded by Peirce's criterion (n = 55) or the average age of all samples except that outside of MIS-2 yields similar values at 19.0 ± 2.6 ka (purple Gaussian peak in Fig. 6D) or 19.2 ± 2.8 ka, respectively. This clustering of ages shows that our method of sampling, dating and interpreting is robust, yielding reliable MIS-2 ages for the inner moraines and suggests that the degradation process on the inner moraines located on the flat plateau is negligible, so that collecting three samples per moraine crest may be sufficient to estimate their emplacement age.

At YJG, the age distribution is quite different from that of the other inner moraines, with the three oldest ages corresponding to the LGM and the six younger ages clustering between 8.0 ± 0.8 and 10.9 ± 1.1 ka (Figs. 4 and S8), i.e., with a bimodal Probability Density Function (PDF) at the LGM and at ~10 ka (pink in Fig. 6D). This moraine is much smaller than any of the other moraines (Fig. 6A) and is not located on the flat Tibetan plateau (>4000 m a.s.l. like all the other moraines from the compilation) but along

its steep edge (3500 m a.s.l.), in a region with more precipitation prograding northwestward in the deep valley of Kangding (Fig. 1, Yu et al., 2018). Therefore we suggest that the young peak at YJG reveals a more degraded morphology, in agreement with its peculiar location. An alternative scenario in which the youngest peak would represent the actual deglaciation age (Younger Dryas) and the older ages would be outliers (inherited samples reworked from upstream) is unlikely, because in that case, the number of old outliers would be much higher (33%) than what we observe for the compilation of inner moraines (<2%). We conclude that the age distribution of the YJG moraine with numerous young ages could be the signature of a highly degraded moraine, and we compare it to the age distribution of the outer moraines (dark blue in Fig. 6C).

6.2. Continuous age distribution of outer moraines: MIS-6 emplacement

The ages at our case study site of Cuopu crest 'c', between MIS-5 and MIS-6 and with one at the MIS-6/MIS-7 limit, show a scattered and continuous distribution suggesting that the sampling is dense enough (n = 8) to be representative. This age distribution is in agreement with that of the regional compilation which is made of one regional study obtained on 14 moraine crests with only 2–4 samples per crest (Fu et al., 2013a). Therefore, despite the fact that a sampling strategy with few samples is inconclusive for just one moraine, when viewed as a whole, the compilation of few ages from numerous crests as done by Fu et al. (2013a) reveals a distribution appearing overall representative of the regional signal (Fig. 4). Such distribution with widely scattered ages prevents the application of statistical tests, as done on the LGM moraines.

Assuming a synchronous glaciation episode over SE Tibet and considering an emplacement mode of the old outer moraines simM.-L. Chevalier, A. Replumaz / Earth and Planetary Science Letters 507 (2019) 105-118



Fig. 6. Statistical analyses of moraine ages. (A) Comparison of moraine extent for each site plotted at the same scale and with the same orientation. Pink tones show MIS-2 (LGM) crests and blue tones show MIS-6 crests. Question mark denotes age uncertainty for inner moraine at GZ, inferred to be LGM. The red lines depict active left-lateral faults plus a normal fault at Cuopu. (B) Corresponding photos of each moraine crest showing boulder sizes (which are much smaller at GZ) and vegetation cover. Photo locations shown by eye symbols in A. (C) Probability density functions (PDF) of outer moraine ¹⁰Be ages from the compilation in Fig. 4 with the dashed curve representing what the distribution might have looked like after a moraine's emplacement (light blue), while the actual curve (dark blue) reflects degradation. Climatic curve of Lisiecki and Raymo (2005) in black (cold pointing down). (D) PDF of inner moraine ¹⁰Be ages from the compilation in Fig. 4 except YJG (purple) and of YJG only (pink), showing the different age distribution: a Gaussian centered on the emplacement age of the moraine for the former, versus a broad distribution with two peaks reflecting degradation at YJG due to its location at the edge of the Tibetan Plateau near the deep valley of Kangding, for the latter. Data from the compilation can be found in Tables 1 and 2.

ilar to that of the LGM inner moraines with few old outliers due to negligible inheritance (<2%), no emplacement age younger than MIS-6 is compatible with a low percentage of old outliers.

6.3. Erosion of outer moraines

The continuous age distribution during MIS-6 and MIS-5 revealed by the compilation and best illustrated at Cuopu crest 'c' (Figs. 2D and 4) is consistent with the age distribution expected from a moraine affected by continuous diffusional degradation. The most important process is the degradation of the matrix, leading to an increasing degree of moraine crest rounding with age, i.e., with its outer position (Fig. 4). This allows exhumation of the boulders which then gradually appear younger. This process has been slow in the studied region, not yet affecting the inner LGM moraines which show no degradation yet (sharp crest) and clustered ages representing the emplacement age, except for the highly degraded YJG moraine.

For the YJG moraine, the degradation mechanism most likely occurs through erosion of the matrix due to heavy rain on the edge of the plateau (Fig. 1), yielding exhumation of buried boulders which then yield exposure ages younger than the moraine emplacement age, but nevertheless preserving a cluster of ages representative of the LGM emplacement age (Fig. 6D). According

to us, the most conservative interpretation of our observations is that some of the original boulders may also be preserved on some well-preserved outer moraines such as Cuopu. Indeed, numerous boulders are still present on Cuopu crest 'c' (Fig. 2), showing no obvious sign of erosion of their surfaces such as knobs or holes. In that case we suggest that some boulders can still record the true emplacement age of the moraine, despite erosion of the matrix. Therefore, we favor this more conservative estimate in which the oldest ages at MIS-6 are representative of the moraine emplacement. Indeed, that the error bar largely overlaps with a MIS-6 age may allow to consider the oldest age at the MIS-6/MIS-7 limit as belonging to MIS-6.

On the contrary, at the GMX site, we noticed in the field that sample grains are coarser, more friable, and relatively easily eroded off the boulders and deposited at their foot compared to the other sites (reddish versus gray granite boulders, respectively, Figs. S1–S7). This observation is indicative of erosion of the boulder surfaces once they are exhumed out of the matrix, which is not observed at Cuopu. We suggest that the age range at GMX outer, which is similar to that of Cuopu crest 'c' with the oldest age being MIS-6 (Fig. 4) but with more numerous younger ages, is due to higher boulder degradation in addition to matrix degradation.

At GZ, only small boulders are present on the outer crest (Fig. S4). The GZ crest is higher (\sim 20 m), steeper (\sim 7–10°, be-

cause deposited in the piedmont) and sharper than Cuopu crest 'c' (a few meters high at places, $\sim 1-3^{\circ}$ slope, deposited in a wide flat basin), which may allow boulders first brought to the surface by exhumation to roll downhill (Figs. 2, 5, 6 and S9) so that the oldest calculated boulder exposure age is younger than the oldest exposure age in the compilation. Indeed despite a dense sampling, the GZ ages show a different distribution than that of the other outer moraines, with no age older than MIS-5 and young ages as young as 9.6 ± 0.9 ka (MIS-1), which account for the most numerous young samples in the compilation (Fig. 4). We speculate that additional dating would lead to the same age distribution.

In summary, the large scatter (from 10 to 200 ka) in the age distribution of the moraines external to the LGM moraines, appears to be the norm rather than the exception (Fig. 4). This pattern is not due to a problem of methodology, nor is it due to a problem of sampling since the LGM moraines' age distribution is clustered. Such a distribution with widely scattered ages requires a dense sampling of each crest to be representative of one age distribution, and prevents the application of statistical tests, as done on the LGM moraines. Our team's dense sampling on three crests allows us to discuss the degradation of the various outer moraines, which we interpret to have experienced similar erosion of the matrix but different degrees of erosion on the boulder surfaces. Indeed, Cuopu shows no clear sign of boulder erosion and has numerous MIS-6 ages, GMX outer clearly shows signs of boulder erosion and has only one MIS-6 age, and GZ has no more large boulder on its crest and no more MIS-6 ages. As no erosion rate of the boulders could be measured or precisely estimated at Cuopu, the most conservative interpretation of our observations is that negligible erosion of the boulders occurred at Cuopu, a well-preserved moraine deposited in a flat sedimentary basin, and that in that case the oldest age of the distribution best represents the true emplacement age, being MIS-6.

The fact that a dense sampling of few crests (such as done by our team) reveals a similar age distribution to that obtained from collecting few samples on numerous crests (as done by Fu et al., 2013a) suggests that the outer moraines sampled in the region by the latter team have experienced similar paleoclimate conditions. However, building of a strong database to precisely understand how past climate might have varied in space and time throughout a region can only be conducted following the former approach of sampling numerous boulders on a moraine crest, as advocated by Chevalier et al. (2011). In addition, having more data per crest allows to better assess the complexity of the erosion processes reflected as a large scatter in the age distribution.

6.4. Regional and global climatic correlations

Considering the MIS-6 oldest ages as representative of the emplacement age, our analysis of the outer moraines' age distribution external to the LGM moraines in SE Tibet shows that they coincide with the major ice peaks of the Northern Hemisphere cooling cycles (Fig. 6C). Plotting the three outer moraine sites discussed in detail here, at the same scale and with the same direction (Fig. 6A) reveals no influence of glacial valley orientation compared to possible dominant wind direction. The position of these moraines out of the present-day influence of the monsoon, i.e., away from the deeply entrenched valleys, receiving <500 mm/yr of rainfall (Fig. 1, Yu et al., 2018; Bookhagen and Burbank, 2010) suggests a weak influence of monsoonal precipitation in the local glacial history, which helps preserve moraines \geq MIS-6. However sites located in areas under the monsoon's influence, such as the YJG site in the Daxue Range, where present-day precipitation is >900 mm/yr (Fig. 1, Yu et al., 2018), are highly degraded with a large age spread from 8 to 18 ka, atypical of LGM moraines for which ages generally cluster well (pink vs purple in Fig. 6D).

6.5. Absence of MIS-3 glaciation in SE Tibet

The compilation of 136 ¹⁰Be boulder exposure ages and interpreted moraine ages from SE Tibet shows that the main glaciations (with the best preserved moraines) are bimodal with peaks at LGM and MIS-6 (Fig. 6C). Indeed, that glacial advances occurred during the LGM, a major cooling episode (e.g., Clark et al., 2009), has been extremely well-documented. Climatic conditions during MIS-6 being highly similar to that during the LGM, both stages corresponding to the largest ice peaks of the global ice volume (Fig. 6C), a MIS-6 glacial advance is the most conservative hypothesis (Fig. 6C). Importantly, the fact that no MIS-3 glaciation is found in the compilation is surprising, especially since it has been shown to be the most common and the most extensive glaciation on the Tibetan Plateau due to abundant precipitation and warm temperature compared to the LGM (e.g., Benn and Owen, 1998; Finkel et al., 2003). This indicates that glaciers from SE Tibet respond more sensitively to a decrease in temperature (e.g., Schäfer et al., 2002; Graf et al., 2008; Strasky et al., 2009; Fu et al., 2013a) than an increase in precipitation (e.g., Benn and Owen, 1998; Finkel et al., 2003). In other words, we suggest that glaciers in SE Tibet were less influenced by the summer monsoon than by the Northern Hemisphere cooling cycles.

7. Conclusion

While most people study moraines that are LGM or younger, few people attempt to study older moraines, due to the difficulty in finding suitable material (large boulders may not be present anymore), the much more degraded morphology of old moraines compared to younger ones, and especially because of the difficulty in interpreting the large age scatter of old moraines and assigning deglaciation ages. Here, using the results from our previous work on tectonics using moraines as offset geomorphic markers, and combining them with other studies from SE Tibet using ¹⁰Be cosmogenic data on moraines external to the LGM inner moraines. our interpretation suggests bimodal moraine ages at MIS-2 and MIS-6 but with very different age distributions. Samples from the inner, sharper moraines span MIS-2 with very few older outliers (<2%). In contrast, the outer moraine ages are widely scattered (10-200 ka). The spread of old moraine ages does not reflect a problem of sampling or methodology proved valid for the younger moraines, but rather, that erosion is responsible for moraine's degradation, yielding ages younger than the deglaciation age. Such degradation is more intense when the moraine crests are steeper or the boulders are more friable, leading to more numerous young ages, and ultimately to the loss of the true deglaciation age. In this case, the oldest age of the distribution best represents the minimum deglaciation age which is MIS-6. This implies that no glacial advance occurred during MIS-3, in contrast to the rest of the Himalayan-Tibetan orogen where they have been found to be the most extensive.

We argue that at Cuopu, our case study where moraines deposited in a flat basin are well-preserved with no clear sign of boulder erosion, the most conservative interpretation is that the oldest age of the distribution best represents the true emplacement age, being MIS-6. In that case, the two main imbricated moraines observed in SE Tibet are MIS-2 and MIS-6 corresponding to the two largest ice peaks of the global ice volume. They respond to the Northern Hemisphere cooling cycles, suggesting that glaciers in SE Tibet are more sensitive to changes in temperature than changes in precipitation.

Acknowledgements

This project was conducted under the auspices of the Natural National Science Foundation of China NSFC [41672210, 41672211],

the China Geological Survey CGS [DD20160022], the Basic Outlay of Scientific Research Work from the Institute of Geology, CAGS [J1528], as well as the Cai Yuanpei program [27968UC] of the China Scholarship Council/French Ministry of Education. We are very grateful to the Observatoire des Sciences de l'Univers de Grenoble (OSUG) for hosting MLC as a visiting Professor to write this paper. We want to thank Arjen Stroeven as well as an anonymous reviewer for their very thorough reviews and suggestions which improved our manuscript.

Appendix A. Supplementary material

Supplementary material related to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2018.11.033.

References

- Allen, C.R., Luo, Z., Qian, H., Wen, X., Zhou, H., Huang, W., 1991. Field study of a highly active fault zone: the XSF of southwestern China. Geol. Soc. Am. Bull. 103, 1178–1199.
- Bai, M., Chevalier, M.-L., Pan, J., Replumaz, A., Leloup, P.H., Métois, M., et al., 2018. Southeastward increase of the late Quaternary slip-rate of the Xianshuihe fault, eastern Tibet. Geodynamic and seismic hazard implications. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 485, 19–31. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2017.12.045.
- Balco, G., Stone, J.O., Lifton, N.A., Dunai, T.J., 2008. A complete and easily accessible means of calculating surface exposure ages or erosion rates from ¹⁰Be and ²⁶Al measurements. Quat. Geochronol. 3 (3), 174–195. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. quageo.2007.12.001.
- Benn, D.I., Owen, L.A., 1998. The role of the Indian summer monsoon and the midlatitude westerlies in Himalayan glaciation: review and speculative discussion. J. Geol. Soc. 155, 353–363.
- Blomdin, R., Stroeven, A.P., Harbor, J.M., Lifton, N.A., Heyman, J., Gribenski, N., et al., 2016. Evaluating the timing of former glacier expansions in the Tian Shan: a key step towards robust spatial correlations. Quat. Sci. Rev. 153, 78–96. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2016.07.029.
- Bookhagen, B., Burbank, D.W., 2010. Toward a complete Himalayan hydrological budget: spatiotemporal distribution of snowmelt and rainfall and their impact on river discharge. J. Geophys. Res. 115, F03019. https://doi.org/10.1029/ 2009JF001426.
- Chen, G., Xu, X., Wen, X., Chen, Y., 2016. Late Quaternary slip-rates and slippartitioning on the southeastern Xianshuihe fault system, Eastern Tibetan Plateau. Acta Geol. Sin. 90, 537–554.
- Chevalier, M.-L., Hilley, G., Tapponnier, P., Van Der Woerd, J., Liu-Zeng, J., Finkel, R.C., et al., 2011. Constraints on the late Quaternary glaciations in Tibet from cosmogenic exposure ages of moraine surfaces. Quat. Sci. Rev. 30 (5–6), 528–554. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2010.11.005.
- Chevalier, M.-L., Leloup, P.H., Replumaz, A., Pan, J., Liu, D., Li, H., et al., 2016. Tectonic-geomorphology of the Litang fault system, SE Tibetan Plateau, and implication for regional seismic hazard. Tectonophysics 682, 278–292. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.tecto.2016.05.039.
- Chevalier, M.-L., Leloup, P.H., Replumaz, A., Pan, J., Métois, M., Li, H., 2017. Temporally constant slip rate along the Ganzi fault, NW Xianshuihe fault system, eastern Tibet. Geol. Soc. Am. Bull. 130 (3–4), 396–410.
- Clark, P.U., Dyke, A.S., Shakun, J.D., Carlson, A.E., Clark, J., Wohlfarth, B., et al., 2009. The Last Glacial Maximum. Science 325, 710–714. https://doi.org/10.1126/ science.1172873.
- Eugster, P., Scherler, D., Thiede, R.C., Codilean, A.T., Strecker, M.R., 2016. Rapid Last Glacial Maximum deglaciation in the Indian Himalaya coeval with midlatitude glaciers: new insights from ¹⁰Be-dating of ice-polished bedrock surfaces in the Chandra Valley, NW Himalaya. Geophys. Res. Lett. 43, 1589–1597. https://doi. org/10.1002/2015GL066077.
- Finkel, R.C., Owen, L.A., Barnard, P.L., Caffee, M.W., 2003. Beryllium-10 dating of Mount Everest moraines indicates a strong monsoon influence and glacial synchroneity throughout the Himalaya. Geology 31, 561–564.
- Fu, P., Heyman, J., Hättestrand, C., Stroeven, A.P., Harbor, J.M., 2012. Glacial geomorphology of the Shaluli Shan area, southeastern Tibetan Plateau. J. Maps 8 (1), 48–55.
- Fu, P., Stroeven, A.P., Harbor, J.M., Hättestrand, C., Heyman, J., Caffee, M.W., et al., 2013a. Paleoglaciation of Shaluli Shan, southeastern Tibetan Plateau. Quat. Sci. Rev. 64, 121–135.
- Fu, P., Harbor, J.M., Stroeven, A.P., Hattestrand, C., Heyman, J., Zhou, L., 2013b. Glacial geomorphology and paleoglaciation patterns in Shaluli Shan, the southeastern Tibetan Plateau – evidence for polythermal ice cap glaciation. Geomorphology 182, 66–78. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geomorph.2012.10.030.

- Gillespie, A., Molnar, P., 1995. Asynchronous maximum advances of mountain and continental glaciers. Rev. Geophys. 33, 311–364.
- Gosse, J., Phillips, F., 2001. Terrestrial in situ cosmogenic nuclides: theory and application. Quat. Sci. Rev. 20, 1475–1560.
- Graf, A.A., Strasky, S., Zhao, Z.Z., Akar, N., Ivy-Ochs, S., Kubik, P.W., et al., 2008. Glacier extension on the eastern Tibetan Plateau in response to MIS 2 cooling, with a contribution to ¹⁰Be and ²¹Ne methodology. In: Strasky, S. (Ed.), Glacial Response to Global Climate Changes: Cosmogenic Nuclide Chronologies from High and Low Latitudes. University of Bern, Bern, pp. 77–110. PhD thesis, ETH Zürich.
- Heyman, J., 2014. Paleoglaciation of the Tibetan Plateau and surrounding mountains based on exposure ages and ELA depression estimates. Quat. Sci. Rev. 91, 30–41. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2014.03.018.
- Heyman, J., Stroeven, A.P., Harbor, J.M., Caffee, M.W., 2011. Too young or too old: evaluating cosmogenic exposure dating based on an analysis of compiled boulder exposure ages. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 302 (1–2), 71–80.
- Kohl, C.P., Nishiizumi, K., 1992. Chemical isolation of quartz for measurement of in situ produced cosmogenic nuclides. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 56, 3583–3587.
- Lal, D., 1991. Cosmic ray labeling of erosion surfaces: in situ nuclide production rates and erosion models. Farth Planet, Sci. Lett. 104, 429–439.
- Li, B., Li, J., Cui, Z., Zheng, B., Zhang, Q., Wang, F., Zhou, S., Shi, Z., Jiao, K., Kang, J., 1991. Quaternary Glacial Distribution Map of Qinghai–Xizang (Tibet) Plateau. Science Press, Beijing. Map scale 1:3,000,000 (in Chinese).
- Li, J., Feng, Z., Zhou, S., 1996. Quaternary glacial remnants in Hengduan Shan. In: Li, J. (Ed.), Glaciers in Hengduan Shan. Science Press, Beijing, pp. 157–173 (in Chinese).
- Lisiecki, L.E., Raymo, M.E., 2005. A Pliocene–Pleistocene stack of 57 globally distributed benthic δ^{18} O records. Paleoceanography 20 (1). https://doi.org/10.1029/2004PA001071.
- Owen, L.A., Finkel, R.C., Barnard, P.L., Ma, H.Z., Asahi, K., Caffee, M.W., et al., 2005. Climatic and topographic controls on the style and timing of Late Quaternary glaciation throughout Tibet and the Himalaya defined by ¹⁰Be cosmogenic radionuclide surface exposure dating. Quat. Sci. Rev. 24 (12–13), 1391–1411.
- Owen, L.A., Caffee, M.W., Finkel, R.C., Seong, Y.B., 2008. Quaternary glaciation of the Himalayan–Tibetan orogen. J. Quat. Sci. 23 (6–7), 513–531.
- Owen, L.A., Dortch, J.M., 2014. Nature and timing of Quaternary glaciation in the Himalayan–Tibetan orogen. Quat. Sci. Rev. 88, 14–54. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. guascirev.2013.11.016.
- Peirce, B., 1852. Criterion for the rejection of doubtful observations. Astron. J. 2, 161–163.
- Prell, W.L., Kutzbach, J.F., 1992. Sensitivity of the Indian monsoon to forcing parameters and implications for its evolution. Nature 360, 647–652.
- Raymo, M.E., Ruddiman, W.F., 1992. Tectonic forcing of late Cenozoic climate. Nature 359, 117–122.
- Schäfer, J.M., Tschudi, S., Zhao, Z., Wu, X., Ivy-Ochs, S., Wieler, R., et al., 2002. The limited influence of glaciations in Tibet on global climate over the past 170000 yr. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 194, 287–297.
- Shi, Y., 2002. Characteristics of late Quaternary monsoonal glaciation on the Tibetan Plateau and in East Asia. Quat. Int. 97–98, 79–91.
- Shi, Y., Liu, X., Li, B., Yao, T., 1999. A very strong summer monsoon event during 30–40 ka BP in the Qinghai–Xizang (Tibet) plateau and its relation to precessional cycle. Chin. Sci. Bull. 44 (20), 1851–1857.
- Stone, J.O., 2000. Air pressure and cosmogenic isotope production. J. Geophys. Res. 105, 23753–23759.
- Strasky, S., Graf, A.A., Zhao, Z., Kubik, P.W., Baur, H., Schlüchter, C., et al., 2009. Late Glacial ice advances in southeast Tibet. J. Asian Earth Sci. 34 (3), 458–465.
- Tschudi, S., Schäfer, J.M., Zhao, Z., Wu, X., Ivy-Ochs, S., Kubik, P.W., et al., 2003. Glacial advances in Tibet during the Younger Dryas? Evidence from cosmogenic ¹⁰Be, ²⁶Al, and ²¹Ne. J. Asian Earth Sci. 22 (4), 301–306.
- Wang, J., Raisbeck, G., Xu, X., Yiou, F., Bai, S., 2006. In situ cosmogenic ¹⁰Be dating of the Quaternary glaciations in the southern Shaluli Mountain on the Southeastern Tibetan Plateau. Sci. China, Ser. D, Earth Sci. 49 (12), 1291–1298.
- Wang, J., Pan, B., Zhang, G., Cui, H., Cao, B., Geng, H., 2013. Late Quaternary glacial chronology on the eastern slope of Gongga Mountain, eastern Tibetan Plateau, China. Sci. China 56, 354–365. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11430-012-4514-0.
- Xu, L., Zhou, S., 2009. Quaternary glaciations recorded by glacial and fluvial landforms in the Shaluli Mountains, southeastern Tibetan Plateau. Geomorphology 103, 268–275.
- Yu, H., Wang, L., Yang, R., Yang, M., Gao, R., 2018. Temporal and spatial variation of precipitation in the Hengduan Mountains region in China and its relationship with elevation and latitude. Atmos. Res. 213, 1–16. https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.atmosres.2018.05.025.
- Zhang, Z., Wang, J., Xu, X., Bai, S., Chang, Z., 2015. Cosmogenic ¹⁰Be and ²⁶Al chronology of the last glaciation of the palaeo-Daocheng Ice Cap, southeastern Qinghai–Tibetan Plateau. Acta Geol. Sin. 89, 575–584.